

*****DRAFT MINUTES*****

Alexandria Board of Architectural Review
Old & Historic Alexandria District

Wednesday, September 21, 2011
7:30pm, City Council Chambers, City Hall
301 King Street, Alexandria, Virginia 22314

Members Present: Tom Hulfish, Chairman
Chip Carlin
Oscar Fitzgerald
Arthur Keleher
John von Senden

Members Absent: Wayne Neale
Peter Smeallie

Staff Present: Planning & Zoning
Courtney Lankford, Historic Preservation Planner
Al Cox, FAIA, Historic Preservation Manager

The meeting was called to order at 7:37 p.m. by Chairman Hulfish.

I. MINUTES

Consideration of the [minutes](#) of the public hearing of September 7, 2011.

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, 5-0

On a motion by Mr. Keleher, seconded by Mr. von Senden, the minutes were approved, as submitted.

II. CONSENT CALENDAR

Items on the Consent Calendar are those where the applicant has agreed to all conditions of approval shown in the staff reports. Without objection, the staff recommendation for these cases will be approved as a group by unanimous consent of the Board at the beginning of the meeting. When announced by the Chairman, any member of the Board or of the public may ask that one of these cases be removed for full discussion.

1. **CASE BAR2011-0244**

Request for brick patio wall at **408 N Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: James & Margaret Durkin

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as submitted, on the Consent Calendar, 5-0.

2. **CASE BAR2011-0246**

Request for alterations at **277 S Washington St**, zoned CD Commercial.

APPLICANT: Eat Good Meat LLC by Paul Beckmann

BOARD ACTION: Deferred prior to hearing due to lack of notice. The Board noted the deferral.

On a motion by Mr. von Senden, seconded by Mr. Keleher, the Consent Calendar, consisting of case BAR2011-0244 was approved, 5-0.

III. DISCUSSION ITEMS

3. CASE BAR2011-0245

Request for alterations at **400 N Union St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Allen & Rebecca Weh by Mehmet Elbirlik

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, 5-0.**

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. That the window replacements comply with the *Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications*;
2. That any rotted window trim is replaced in kind;
3. That the rear patio door replacement comply with the *Alexandria Replacement Window Performance Specifications*.
4. That the two windows on the front and side facades be feature windows to provide more architectural interest at the pedestrian level.

SPEAKERS

Mehmet Elbirlik, architect for the project, spoke on behalf of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

There was no Board discussion.

Mr. Keleher moved the Staff recommendation which was seconded by Mr. von Senden and approved, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found that the alterations included in this project would respect the existing property and would not adversely impact the adjacent Founders Park.

4. CASE BAR2011-0247

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **207 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Wesley & Betty Foster by Scot McBroom

BOARD ACTION: **Deferred for restudy, 5-0.**

This item was combined with item #5 for discussion purposes.

5. CASE BAR2011-0248

Request for addition and brick garden wall at **207 S Fairfax St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Wesley & Betty Foster by Scot McBroom

BOARD ACTION: **Deferred for restudy, 5-0.**

SPEAKERS

Scot McBroom, architect for the project, spoke on behalf of the application.

John Hynan, Historic Alexandria Foundation, spoke in opposition of the application.

Gina Baum, neighbor at 203 & 205 S Fairfax, spoke in support of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Hulfish noted that this application was before the BAR as a conceptual review and stated that he thought a deferral was a good idea considering the loss of open space that would result if this project is approved. Mr. Hulfish explained that he was not comfortable with the current concept, as proposed.

Mr. Keleher felt that the addition should not be built, that it was not appropriate for the subject property. He stated that he could not see a garage being approved in this location, but that a parking area could be appropriate if placed in the rear, where carriage houses were historically located.

Mr. Fitzgerald identified how encapsulation could be detrimental to the property. He expressed that the design for the gate appeared very modernistic. Mr. McBrom stated that the design was based on a 19th century style fence on South Columbus.

Mr. von Senden explained that while the structure was very well designed and detailed, that it was four times as large as it needed to be. He felt that the dividing wall was too close and cut the parking at 203 South Fairfax by too much. He stated that he would rather see a detached structure of a smaller scale.

Mr. Carlin agreed with his fellow Board members and added that he could never support the current design. He remarked on the significance of this block, including the large amount of open space that still remains. Mr. Carlin said that he could not support an attached garage structure as it was not historically appropriate. He explained that he could support a fully detached, open trellis design, but that he would not support a garden wall.

Mr. Keleher moved the staff recommendation which was seconded by Mr. Fitzgerald and approved 5-0.

REASON

The Board found that an attached two car garage with storage space and garden wall was not appropriate or compatible with this historic property or the historic district as a whole. The Board felt that an open trellis would be suitable.

6. **CASE BAR2011-0249**

Request for demolition/encapsulation at **734 S Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Katherine Reid

BOARD ACTION: **Approved, as amended, by a roll call vote, 5-0.**

This item was combined with item #7 for discussion purposes.

7. **CASE BAR2011-0250**

Request for addition at **734 S Royal St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Katherine Reid

BOARD ACTION: Approved, as amended, by a roll call vote, 5-0.

CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

1. The proposed aluminum-clad wood windows will contain a 5/8" muntin and comply with the *Alexandria Window Performance Specifications*.
2. The statements in archaeology conditions below shall appear in the General Notes of all site plans and on all site plan sheets that involve demolition or ground disturbance (including Basement/Foundation Plans, Demolition, Erosion and Sediment Control, Grading, Landscaping, Utilities, and Sheeting and Shoring) so that on-site contractors are aware of the requirements:
 - a. The applicant/developer shall call Alexandria Archaeology immediately (703-838-4399) if any buried structural remains (wall foundations, wells, privies, cisterns, etc.) or concentrations of artifacts are discovered during development. Work must cease in the area of the discovery until a City archaeologist comes to the site and records the finds.
 - b. The applicant/developer shall not allow any metal detection to be conducted on the property, unless authorized by Alexandria Archaeology.

SPEAKERS

Katherine Reid, applicant, spoke in support of the application.

Ray Novitske, architect, spoke on behalf of the application.

BOARD DISCUSSION

Mr. Keleher stated his interest in this building and thought the addition was well designed and unobtrusive. Mr. Keleher moved the Staff recommendation, which was seconded by Mr. von Senden, and approved by a roll call vote, 5-0.

REASON

The Board found that the addition was an appropriate design solution that met the needs of the homeowner, did not damage historic fabric and was compatible with the historic district.

IV. DEFERRED

8. **CASE BAR2011-0098**

Request for approval of a screened porch at **108 Quay St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Kenneth & Martha Gabriel

Deferred pending resolution of outstanding issues.

BOARD ACTION: The Board noted the deferral.

9. **CASE BAR2011-0124**

Request for alterations at **121 S Columbus St** and **803 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Nancy Petersen by Joel deLeon

Deferred prior to hearing at the applicants request.
BOARD ACTION: The Board noted the deferral.

IV. OTHER BUSINESS

1. Staff presentation of King Street Web Address Survey.
 2. Information regarding 313 S Columbus Street window restoration.
 3. Debrief on 329 N Saint Asaph appeal to City Council.
 4. Information about 122 Prince appeal of BZA decision to Circuit Court.
-

V. ADJOURNMENT

Chairman Hulfish adjourned the meeting at approximately 8:40pm.

VI. ADMINISTRATIVE APPROVALS

The following items are shown for information only. Based on the Board's adopted policies, these have been approved by Staff since the previous Board meeting.

CASE BAR2011-0251

Request for signage at **238 S West St**, zoned CRMU/L Commercial.

APPLICANT: Beasley Square

CASE BAR2011-0253

Request for roof replacement at **718 Gibbon St**, zoned RB Residential.

APPLICANT: Richard Faulkner

CASE BAR2011-0257

Request for signage at **1010 King St, Suite 2**, zoned KR King Street Retail.

APPLICANT: Eyebrow Express Threading

CASE BAR2011-0258

Request for satellite antenna at **426 ½ N Saint Asaph St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Alan Windsor

CASE BAR2011-0265

Request for window replacement at **1315 Prince St**, zoned RM Residential.

APPLICANT: Karel & Ashley Malinousky by Richard Jones

Minutes submitted by,

Courtney Lankford, Historic Preservation Planner
Boards of Architectural Review